

**COOKEVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MINUTES
FEBRUARY 11, 2014
5:00 P.M.**

The Cookeville Historic Zoning Commission met on Tuesday, February 11, 2014, at 5:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers, 45 East Broad Street, Cookeville, TN 38501.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Alma Anderson, Lee Carney, Calvin Dickinson, Cathy Lamb, Greg Stamps, Chris Wakefield, and Julia Woodford.

STAFF PRESENT: James Mills and Jayne Barns.

STAFF ABSENT: Ken Young.

OTHERS PRESENT: Peter Metts, Lauren Metts, and Megan Trotter.

CONSIDER FOR APPROVAL THE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 12, 2013. Calvin Dickinson made the motion to approve the minutes of November 12, 2013. Alma Anderson seconded the motion and the motion carried unanimously. **APPROVED.**

CONSIDER FOR APPROVAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE ADDITION OF A GARAGE, PORCH, 500 SQ. FT. ADDITION FOR A MASTER BEDROOM & BATHROOM, ALTERATION TO ROOF, AND RENOVATIONS TO THE EXTERIOR ON THE HOME LOCATED AT 125 EAST 4TH STREET. REQUEST SUBMITTED BY PETER METTS. James Mills stated that Mr. Peter Metts has submitted for approval an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for additions, alterations and numerous renovations to the structure located at 125 East 4th Street. The subject property, along with 13 other properties located along Cherry and Holly Avenues and East 4th Street, was added to the North Dixie Avenue Historic District in 2008. It is zoned as RS-15, Single Family Residential.

The proposed additions consists of an attached garage with a second floor living area accessed from the main structure, a master bed room with a master bath and closet to the rear of the main structure, and a new front porch. The proposed alterations and renovations include a change in the slope of part of the roof, addition of a dormer to the roof, new shingles, new siding, new windows, driveway modification, new exterior lighting, and new guttering. Mr. Metts indicates that the existing structure has undergone numerous past modifications and had been converted to a multi-family dwelling. Multi-family residential is a nonconforming use in the RS-15 District. The proposed project would return the structure to its original conforming use, a single family, cottage style home.

The Zoning Code provisions for the HS, Historic District require that certain determinations be made in evaluating an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

These are as follows:

- The proposed action is in harmony with the intent of the HS, Historic District,
- The proposed action would complement other structures within the HS District,
- The proposed action complies with the “Standards for Rehabilitation” as promulgated by the Secretary of the Interior,
- The proposed action complies with any applicable Design Guidelines (Design Guidelines have been adopted for the North Dixie Avenue Historic District).

Section VII of the Design Guidelines for the North Dixie Historic District provides the following guidelines for additions: *(staff report in italics)*

- New additions shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*
- The new work generally shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, materials, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*
- Additions shall resemble the same period as the existing structure. *(developer indicates compliance)*
- Materials and pitch of roof shall be compatible with existing structure. *(developer indicates compliance)*
- The scale of additions shall be compatible with, not overpowering the existing structure. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*
- Additions shall be located to the rear, if at all possible, or to the side of the existing structure. *(proposal complies with this guideline)*
- The number, size and glazing pattern of apertures shall be consistent with existing structure and surrounding structures. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*
- Original front setbacks from the street shall be maintained. *(proposal complies with this guideline)*
- Building materials shall be similar to those employed historically. *(developer indicates compliance)*
- Acceptable roofing materials. *(developer indicates compliance)*
- Acceptable siding materials. *(developer indicates compliance)*
- Foundations shall be compatible with existing structural foundations is possible. *(compliance unknown)*
- Chimneys shall be of masonry construction. *(compliance unknown)*

Section V of the Design Guidelines for the North Dixie Historic District provides guidelines for alterations and rehabilitation to existing structures. The following guidelines are applicable for the proposed project: *(staff report in italics)*

- Original building materials, including masonry, wood siding, and wall shingles should be retained. Where replacement of building materials is necessary, new materials shall match the design, dimension, detail, and all visual characteristics of the originals, based on physical or historical documentation. *(developer indicates*

compliance),

- Original architectural details should be retained. Where replacement is necessary, new architectural details shall match the design of the originals, based on physical or historical documentation. *(developer indicates compliance),*
- Original porch elements should be repaired rather than replaced when possible. When damaged elements are repaired, the detail of the existing original material shall be matched. *(proposal does not comply with this guideline),*
- An entire porch shall be replaced only if it is too deteriorated to repair, is completely missing, or is dysfunctional for its intended use. *(proposal does not comply with this guideline)* The new porch shall match the style of the house in materials, size, and detail. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline),*
- Removing or radically changing entrances and porches important in defining the building's overall historic character is prohibited. If altering the porch and/or entrance, ensure that the new treatment matches or blends with the original style or character of the house. *(proposal does not comply with this guideline),*
- Substituting the original doors with stock size doors that do not fit the opening properly or do not blend with the style of the house is prohibited. Transom windows and sidelights shall be retained. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline),*
- Retain original windows and window openings if possible. Replace original windows only when they are missing or beyond repair. Use true or simulated divided lights, in a similar configuration, when replacing windows to match the remaining originals. *(proposal does not comply with this guideline),*
- The use of materials or finishes that radically change the sash, depth of reveal, muntin configuration, the reflective quality or color of the glazing, or the appearance of the frame is prohibited. *(proposal does not comply with this guideline),*
- The number, location, size, and glazing pattern of windows on primary elevations shall be retained. New openings, blocking in windows, or installing replacement sashes that do not fit the window openings are prohibited. If a window is no longer needed, the glass should be retained and the backside frosted, screened, or shuttered so that it appears from the outside to be in use. *(proposal does not comply with this guideline).*

Section VI of the Design Guidelines for the North Dixie Historic District provides guidelines for new construction. The following new construction guidelines are applicable for the subject project: *(staff report in italics)*

- The setback from front and side yard property lines established by adjacent historic buildings shall be maintained if possible, or accommodated to maintain a rhythm. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*
- New garages or outbuildings shall be located to the rear of the main house. *(proposal does not comply with this guideline)*
- The relationship of width to height of windows and doors, and the rhythm of solids (walls) to voids (door and window openings) in new buildings shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*

- The roof of a new building shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the roof shape, orientation, and pitch of surrounding historic buildings. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*
- The shape of a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with those of surrounding historic buildings. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*
- The materials, texture, and details of a new building's public facades shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. Materials include, but are not limited to, wood, brick, stone, mortar, roofing concrete, and metals. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*
- New garages or outbuildings shall be designed to be compatible with the style of the major buildings on the site, especially in materials and roof slope. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*
- The scale of new garages or outbuildings shall not overpower the existing house or the size of the existing lot. *(proposal appears to comply with this guideline)*

Based on the information submitted the proposed project will comply with most, but not all, of the specified guidelines. There are three components of the project that do not completely comply. These are the proposed new porch, windows and garage. While the project involves significant changes to the original porch and widows, items that the guidelines strive to protect, in the opinion of the Planning Department the proposed changes will greatly improve the appearance of the dwelling. Due to past modifications the original style of the structure has been lost and the proposed improvements will allow the style to become more apparent.

The project also proposes to locate a two-car garage to the side of the principal structure. While not an ideal location based on the design guidelines for the district, there does not appear to a more suitable location for a garage on the parcel. It should also be noted Mr. Metts indicates that he intends to return to green space a significant portion of the existing driveway that was apparently added to accommodate numerous vehicles when the structure was used for multi-family purposes.

While the project does not fully comply with all components of the design guidelines, waiver or modification of these requirements may be justified. In the opinion of the Planning Department, the conversion of a nonconforming multi-family dwelling to a single family dwelling and the complete renovation of a dilapidated structure will be of significant benefit to the overall character of the Historic District. Additionally, the project will result in a dwelling with a cottage style appearance which would be more suitable and compatible with other dwellings in the district than is the current hodge-podge structure.

Staff recommended approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Alma Anderson made the motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness for 125 East 4th Street. Cathy Lamb seconded the motion and the motion carried unanimously.

APPROVED.

STAFF REPORT ON AMENDMENTS TO THE ZONING CODE. James Mills reported that the Planning Commission at their January 27, 2014 meeting approved the amendments to the Zoning Code as recommended by the Historic Zoning Commission. The amendments pertaining to the number of property owners required to be in favor of the establishment of a HS, Historic Overlay Zone was changed from 2/3rd to simple majority. The City Council will hold a Public Hearing on March 6, 2014.

STAFF REPORT ON TENNESSEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION GRANT APPLICATION. James Mills reported that the Tennessee Historic Preservation Grant application for development and production of a walking tour brochure of the Historic Districts has been submitted. Awards will not be made until October.

ANNOUNCEMENT: Calvin Dickinson announced that the Tennessee Historical Commission will hold their next meeting on Friday, February 21, 2014 at the Fairfield Inn in Cookeville starting at 9:00 a.m. The public is welcome to attend.

ADJOURNMENT: 5:15 P.M.

SUBMITTED FOR APPROVAL

SUBMITTED FOR RECORDING

**JAYNE BARNS CPS
PLANNING ASSISTANT**

**GREG STAMPS, CHAIRMAN
COOKEVILLE HISTORIC ZONING**